

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
<p>Green = Stirling Council actions Yellow = CAT legal requirements Red = Point of Interest: the first panel met after the original decision date.</p>			
15/1/20 3-7pm			Stirling Council (SC) drop in meeting in village hall to propose parking charges in Balmaha car park. Many residents asked if any funds would be ring fenced for the community but informed this was not the case.
29/1/20			East Loch Lomond Community Trust (ELLCT) trustees' meeting decided to take forward previous work on the CAT of Balmaha Car Park and as detailed in the successful CAT of the area at the entrance of the car park.
2.2.20	Margaret McDonald (MM)	Louise Reid-Thomas (L R-T)	Asset Trans Stage 1 sent by email and by snail mail
3.3.20	L R-T	MM	1. Specific area requested 2. Community Engagement copied in
16.3.20	MM	L R-T	asking for update
17.3.20	Pam Campbell(P C)	MM	Confirm Stage 1 meets criteria under Section 77 of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act Attachment - 170919 CAT Process_FINAL.docx
1.4.20	MM	PC	MM request for Stage 2 form
20.4.20	MM	PC	Draft sent
22.4.20	PC	MM	Comments returned
16.8.20	MM	PC	Stage 2 sent to PC for comments
16.8.20	MM	L R-T	completed Stage 2 nearly finished
17.8.20	PC	MM	Comments returned
21.8.20	MM	L R-T, PC	Completed Stage 2 form sent
24.8.20	PC	MM	Sight of business plan requested, confirmation of less than best value and same as transfer of toilet block site ie £1
25.8.20	MM	PC	Confirm same as toilet block & Business Plan to follow.
26.8.20	PC	MM	PC will advise Neil Gordon who will take the lead
22.9.20	MM	PC	Business plan sent
22.9.20	PC	MM	comments returned
23.9.20	MM	PC	additional support requested
23.9.20	PC	MM	link to docs received
29.9.20	MM	PC	points of clarification requested
30.9.20	PC	MM	clarification received
1.10.20	MM	PC	completed BP sent
5.10.20	PC	MM	thanks sent
12.10.20	MM	Neil Gordon(NG)	Business Plan sent to support the Stage 2 form submitted 21.8.20 Acknowledgement requested.

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
13.10.20	MM	GL (Gordon Lawrie)	Stage 2 & Bus Plan sent to Gordon Lawrie as Neil Gordon auto reply rec'd as on holiday
13.10.20	GL	MM	GL will discuss with NG on his return.
29.10.20	MM	PC	letter of support from Bruce Crawford forwarded
29.10.20	PC	MM	PC will forward letter to NG. Questions re other letters
29.10.20	MM	PC	MM advised letter represented both Bruce Crawford and Alyn Smith
6.1.21	PC	MM	Peer review comments of business plan
6.1.21	MM	PC	MM happy re comments and asked about timescales
31.1.21	MM	PC	Amended business plan sent
1.2.21	PC	MM	acknowledged and will ask colleagues for timescale
2.2.21	MM	PC	Accountant Financials sent
23.3.21	MM	PC	Letter of support from Lord Graham forwarded
25.3.21	MM	PC	Asking why no communication re Asset Transfer and how to escalate.
31.3.21	MM	GL & NG	No correspondence since 13 October 2020 - why?
31/3/21			Proposal to impose parking charges in Balmaha car park passed at committee.
7/4/21	GL	MM	acknowledgement asset transfer request & is under Community Empowerment Act 2015
9/9/21	MM	GL	express relief of acknowledgement but timeline is not correct
13/4/21	MM	GL	Stating dates of submission of CAT Stage 2 was 21/8/20 & BP on 12/10/20. Outlined community projects
19/4/21	MM	GL	asking if last email arrived
19/4/21	GL	MM	Still considering Bus. Plan - Drew Leslie to contact MM
19/4/21	MM	GL	Stating BP has been with SC since 12/10/21 concerned taking so long.
20/4/21	DL (Drew Leslie)	MM	DL call to MM mobile while driving. MM asked DL to call when MM at home.
20/4/21	DL	MM	email asking when good to call
20/4/21	MM	DL	MM reply with availability
22/4/21	DL	MM	Call - MM explained community frustration with lack of response from SC re asset transfer and participation request.
2/5/21	MM	DL	2 weeks since talked on phone - still no official communication. asked for urgent update. Marked the email urgent.
13/5/21	MM	DL	8mths since stage 2 submitted with no progress & no answer to last email - response requested by end of next day
14/5/21	DL	MM	Apology, saying difficult couple of weeks, Trying to square off corporate discussions. DL talked with LM (Lynn Molleson, COSS) - 'get this moved'

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
25/5/21	DL	MM	Apology for time taken to respond. Hope to set realistic timescale. Process to be reported through internal governance. DL to speak to officers re validation. Proposed a call to discuss.
26/5/21	MM	DL	Expressed long delays leading to frustration that 7mths after submission the official process is starting. Agreed to call and requested it be recorded.
26/5/21	DL	MM	Extra staff in estates team and a timeline to be drawn up. Arrangement to talk on Friday 28 May
27/5/21	DL	MM	Teams call set up for 28/5/21
28/5/21	TEAMS		MM asked for validation date by end of day given its over 7mths since competent CAT received. MM suggested either disorganisation or lack of competence had resulted in the delay. DL to confirm with team no issues preventing validation. GL on leave but responded saying will get back to DL later in day. DL will chase up any internal issues to emerge. A few working days but will do as quickly as possible.
28/5/21	CF (Carlyn Fraser)	MM	Response to complaint re: short notice car park closure relining/ island removal/works - no community info
7/6/21	DL	MM	Picking up with GL where he is with process
7/6/21	MM	DL, GL, LM (Lynn Molleson)	MM emailed in response to a missed call
8/6/21	GL	MM	asked MM to call his mobile when free
8/6/21	MM	GL	MM answered some questions before sending out letter before end of week (11/6/21)
11/6/21	MM	GL	asking if letter had been sent
11/6/21	GL	MM	apologies - DL didn't have time to sign letter before leaving. DL back on Tuesday letter asap on return
11/6/21	MM	GL	disappointing there's another delay
11/6/21	GL	MM	urgent covid-related issues taking priority
16/6/21	MM	GL,DL, (Tracy Mills) ,LM	will letter be sent out today?
17/6/21	MM	GL,DL,TM,LM	when will the letter be with us?
18/6/21	DL	MM	DL's manager briefed. Confirm validation tomorrow.
18/6/21	SR	MM	validation letter attached
18/6/21	MM	DL, GL, LM	Third paragraph has incorrect community organisation named. request to amend.
18/6/21	DL	MM	Will get it changed & update briefed CEx and Elected members to be emailed.
18/6/21	DL	MM	correctly addressed validation letter (date of validation 8/6/21) Decision Date set as 8/12/21
6/9/21	CF	MM	Go live of parking charges confirmed as 6/9/21

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
24/11/21	GL	MM	Verbal request to an extension to the decision deadline
24/11/21	MM	GL	3 month date extension agreed
3/12/21	GL	MM	Official letter requesting extension to 7/3/22 (1st extension)
5/12/21	MM	GL	MM replied with ELLCT agreement
24/1/22	GL	MM	request from SC for permission to share ELLCT accountant forecast to DV to aid valuation. Agreed.
11/2/22			1st meeting of CAT decision board
14/2/22	GL	MM	GL sent questions from the Decision Board
15/2/22	MM	GL	MM send ELLCT responses
Date	From	To	
2/3/22	DL	MM	DL verbally informed MM of SC valuation £1.6m and suggested face to face meeting to discuss. Another extension was agreed
4/3/22	GL	MM	Formal letter re decision date received and agreement returned (2nd extension)
20/3/22	MM	DL	over 2 weeks since a meeting agreed MM asked when will it take place
21/3/22	MM	DL	MM request for the DV's assumptions and evidence do the SC valuation [these were never provided]
21/3/22	DL	MM	DL asked for avails
24/3/22	MM	DL	MM offered 3 dates over the following 2 weeks
25/3/22	DL	MM	been swamped, will follow up and will get this shared.
29/3/22	DL	MM	DL struggling for a date asked SR (Sam Ramsay) to see what can be arranged
29/3/22	MM	DL	MM will be as flexible as possible
30/3/22	SR	MM	emailed to arrange a call to agree a date
30/3/22	MM	SR	MM replied with time to call - no call happened that day
5/4/22	SR	MM, LM	proposing Tues 12 or The 14 March 17:30hrs Balmaha
8/4/22	DL	MM, LM	Meeting arranged for Tues 12 April 2022 at 17:30hrs in Balmaha
12/4/22	MM	DL	Asking again for DV's rationale.
12/4/22	Face to face meeting	Balmaha Coffee Shop	MM, DL & LM met in Balmaha to discuss CAT
14/4/22	LM	MM, DL	LM sent a summary of discussion of 12 April meeting (see appendix 3 below)
18/4/22	MM	LM, DL	email with thanks and offer of meeting with SC officers and reminder of decision date change
21/4/22	DL	MM	Has fed back discussions of 12/4/22 to senior officers. Attached a request for a further extension until 15/08/22 (3rd extension)
21/4/22	MM	DL	extension request confirmation letter emailed.

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
21/4/22	DL	MM	Acknowledged receipt and thanks sent.
6/5/22	DL	MM	Informed of CAT on agenda of internal board meeting the next week. DL to report feedback/plan
6/5/22	MM	DL	MM offer to meet with officers. Also willing to participate with SC & the NPA developing the Strategic Infrastructure Framework plan.
12/5/22	DL	MM	Next step to get a bit more consensus with senior officers. Will be in touch next week.
28/6/22	MM	LM	email to let LM know nothing from SC for 6 weeks after commitment to contact in 1 week.
29/6/22	LM	DL ccMM	cc in email from LM to DL asking what is happening
30/6/22	DL	LM ccMM	Cllrs briefed, report to internal board prepared, meeting on 13 July.
1/8/22	MM	DL	requesting update as next decision date fast approaching
3/8/22	DL	MM	Has had discussions and will revert with commitments
3/8/22	MM	DL	Offer to supply further info as needed and favourable to an extension if required.
4/8/22	DL	MM	DL will aim to speak with head of Communities and confirm how they will engage.
5/8/22	DL	MM	DL not able to sit down with Head of People & Community Wellbeing, request for an extension
7/8/22	MM	DL	MM will look out for request
9/8/22	DL	MM	Official letter requesting extension to 30/9/22 (4th extension)
10/8/22	MM	DL	official agreement to extension request based on a clear understanding of steps SC will take towards a decision and suggesting a joint valuation as previously proposed in April 2022.
19/8/22	MM	DL	Highlighting that in agreeing to the recent extension the ELLCT asked for a clear understanding of SC's process towards a decision and requesting details of this as well as offering any assistance needed. ∴ No reply received
1/9/22	MM	DL	Reminding only 2 weeks to deadline and again asking for a clear understanding of SC plans to issuance of a decision and about a joint valuation.
5/9/22	DL	MM	Apologies for not being in touch has 'set aside some time this week to pull together what I've spoken about with other'
5/9/22	MM	DL	email acknowledged
13/9/22 approx			Phone call from DL discussion re further extension and commitment to provide carpark receipts and suggesting a meeting.
14/9/22	DL	MM	noting the deadline is 30 Sept and suggesting a meeting from 15 Oct onwards. Extension request to 7 December 2022 (5th extension)
14/9/22	MM	DL	Agreement of extension date and receiving car park data and a discussion re valuation.

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
26/9/22	MM	DL	Asking for the car park data and when the meeting date was.
29/9/22	DL	MM	DL has car park income waiting for session info the following week
29/9/22	MM	DL	acknowledgement
6/10/22	MM	DL	Asking for car park data again and if SC legal team has advised on the previously discussed joint valuation.
6/10/22	DL	MM	Income data received - no session data until next week. Ask that ELLCT to look into the income numbers. Re joint valuation - 'we're a bit stuck around valuation'
6/10/22	MM	DL	acknowledgement
7/10/22	DH (Dan Hartles)	MM	Car park session info sent and acknowledged.
25/10/22	MM	DL	Request to confirm a date to discuss valuation assessments.
26/10/22	DL	MM	Response was 'Yes, will do.'
26/10/22	MM	DH (David Henderson COSS)	Agreed DH would again suggest the joint valuation.
31/10/22	DH (COSS)	DL	introducing himself and suggesting a joint valuation as per SG guidance.
7/11/22	MM	RF (Rosemary Fraser)	given the lack of communication from SC, as a local councillor RF asked to find out if any progress had been made regarding the proposed meeting and joint valuation (proposed by David Henderson, COSS)
8/11/22	DL	DH (COSS)	in response to the joint valuation suggestion - 'just looking at the options we have'.
8/11/22	RF	MM	DL hasn't responded to RF, she will email. She said capital projects were taking up a lot of officers' time.
11/11/22	MM	DL	Summary emailed of telephone call DL made to MM. DL will speak to legal team next week re joint valuation and will get back. An online meeting to be arranged and I requested DH (COSS) to be an attendee. Response for DL he agreed with summary.
16/11/22	DL	MM	DL has received advice regarding valuation and will follow it up. MM-acknowledged email.
21/11/22	DH (COSS)	MM	asking if he might flag up to SC the closeness of the decision date MM replied yes
22/11/22	DH (COSS)	DL	Asking for clarity re decision date. No response
1/12/22	DL	MM	Asking if available for a discussion - MM replied yes - DL response 'I'll be in touch'

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
4/12/22	MM	DL	Summary of telephone conversation. 1. SC legal team advice that a joint valuation may not be preferred option. 2. DL offered to coordinate a meeting between SC legal and David (COSS) to talk options. 3. Subject to trustees agreement, the ELLCT will update business position based on SC data. 4. decision date - a extension to be requested by SC
4/4/22	DL	DH (COSS)	offering a meeting with Mark Easton (Legal SC) and DL.
5/12/22	DL	MM	Following the telephone conversation with DL an email with a further extension request emailed anticipating this will be the final extension request to 31/3/23 (6th extension)
6/12/22	MM	DL	extension request agreed working toward a joint valuation and the ELLCt producing a revised economic forecast.
9/12/22	DH (COSS)	MM	No dates from DL yet
13/12/22	DL	DH (COSS)	Trying to get a date slotted in with SC legal rep. Acknowledged by DH(COSS)
19/12/22	DH (COSS)	DL	Seven avails 5th Jan-9Feb suggested to DL
20/12/22	DL	DH (COSS)	Dates appreciated will try and confirm in a couple of days
3/1/23	MM	DL & DH (COSS)	has a date been agreed. happy to attend if avail but can go-ahead without. DH (COSS) replied with link for 4/1/23 but MM not avail
4/1/23	DH (COSS)	MM	recap of meeting - SC not keen on joint valuation indication DV wouldn't be willing. SC to dicuss internally before coming back. MM Acknowledged.
9/1/23	DL	MM	Good discussion with DH(COSS) last week, had discussions with DV. Asked if ELLCT had started looking at the business case based on SC data. MM responded by return confirming the ELLCT working on update and happy to meet to discuss moving on with valuation.
13/1/23	DL	MM	DV has agreed to progress. DL to Speak to GL
13/1/23	MM	DL	Asked for clarification - does this mean a joint valuation? DL confirmed yes and Estates team will be in touch re details.
31/1/23	MM	DL	ELLCT not heard from Estates Team. Would like to discuss Terms of Reference who should MM contact?
24/2/23	GL	MM	the DV's conditions to proceed with a valuation. MM asked for the assumptions the valuation would be based on and will discuss with trustees.
2/3/23	MM	GL	Trustees response to conditions. All acceptable subject to agreeing the DV's assumptions for the valuation. Requested these.
9/3/23	MM	GL	Where are we with the joint valuation?
10/3/23	GL	MM	GL replied saying he had formally asked the DV to progress the works.
10/3/23	MM	GL	MM asked do we not need to agree the assumptions before proceeding? GL replied with the assumptions.

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
16/3/23	MM	GL	No contact from DV - asked for DV to be in touch to discuss the assumptions.
17/3/23	MM	DL	phoned DL as had no communication re DV
17/3/23	DMC (David MacColl)	MM	email from DV with ToE
27/3/23	GL	MM	Request for extension to 31 July 2023. MM replied agreeing (7th extension)
6/4/23	DMC	MM/GL	DV informed SC & ELLCT he cannot act in a joint capacity as DVS had acted for one of the parties previously.
6/4/23	GL	MM	SC suggest they contact commercial valuation companies. Agreed
25/4/23	MM	GL	Any update?
26/4/23	GL	MM	20 companies emailed inviting them to tender and report by 9th June. MM acknowledged.
5/5/23	MM	GL	Asked the outcome of the tendering process and requested the brief sent to the companies.
9/5/23	GL	MM	Only one company replied. Agreed to proceed.
19/6/23	GL	MM	Valuation from Graham & Sibbald £485k
19/6/23	MM	GL	Updated ELLCT financial projection based on SC data sent & documentation to follow.
26/6/23	GL	MM	asking if an updated business plan will be submitted. MM responded it can be.
19/7/23	MM	GL	When we we know the decision?
19/7/23	GL	MM	The team are still considering. Also asked what ELLCT will offer.
20/7/23	MM	GL	Understood the decision would be made in principle and then a sum negotiated.
27/7/23	GL	MM	SC Decision Board felt unable to reach a decision need more information and had 11 points requiring clarification. A further extension will be requested.
28/7/23	GL	MM	Further extension request to 30/11/23 (8th extension)
28/7/23			Community Enterprise engaged to advise and support ELLCT
30/7/23	MM	GL	ELLCT agree to extension
10/11/23	MM	DL	Updated Business Plan with recent public consultation and financials submitted.
13/11/23	MM	DL	Request acknowledgement of receipt of BP. Acknowledged by Sam Ramsay, PA to Drew Leslie
29/11/23	GL	MM	Difficulty getting a suitable date to convene the Board will be requesting a further extension. Necessary arrangement will be put in place to make a final decision.

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
29/11/23	MM	GL	Asked for the updated income data, as previously indicated, as our model is based on the last income date supplied by SC to the end of October 2022.
30/11/23	MM	GL	Have I missed the official request?
30/11/23	GL	MM	Official extension request to 31/01/24 and will arrange updated income data to be sent. (9th extension)
26/1/24	TM (Tracey Mills) telephone call	MM	We discussed some of the community benefit projects and benefits ownership of the car park would bring and I emailed TM with an account of the projects as outlined in the BP and reinforced we would continue to work with Loch Lomond and Trossachs National Park (LLTNP) and Stirling Council in positive and cooperative partnership.
26/1/24	MM	TM	In response to a telephone conversation with Tracey Mills I sent an email outlining community plans subject to members' approval. See appendix 4 below
29/1/24	DL telephone call	MM	"nearly over the line' but the panel feel there is still a few gaps. They need to demonstrate community value against lack of income. Tried to explain about rural wealth building and community empowerment. Agreed to meet in person. Was asked about a further one month extension but offered two months to be on the safe side.
31/1/24	GL	MM	Official extension request received on the decision date deadline. New deadline 31/3/24 (10th extension date)
5/2/24	MM	DL	Meeting in council offices with Drew Leslie (Tracey Mills unavailable) Main concerns seem to be re loss of income to SC. DL proposed a joint meeting with LLTNP, SC & ELLCT which would be welcomed.
25/3/24	MM	DL	Deadline fast approaching over a holiday weekend. Will SC communicate a decision before the deadline?
25/3/24	TM	MM	Responding for DL 'working towards to agreed deadline'
28/3/24	TM	MM	<p>After 2years 9mths from the validation date and with less than 5hrs before end of working day on the holiday weekend with the deadline falling on Easter Sunday this was communicated.</p> <p>On completing the review and assessment of your Asset Transfer Application, we have realised that there may be a requirement to take your application, if successful to Committee for final consideration.</p> <p>Due to officer delegated authority under Stirling Council Standing Order and in relation to the now income stream generated and the valuation of the asset. Officers are activity seeking clarity and advice from our legal team to ensure compliance with all legal obligations, whatever the final decision and outcome will be.</p> <p>Due the bank holiday weekend, could I ask for an extension to Friday 12th April. Officer have put meetings in the diary with all relevant services to meet this deadline.</p>
28/3/24	MM	TM	As this was to be the final extension will contact fellow trustees before replying.
28/3/24	MM	TM	Trustees agree to this extension to 12/4/24

Balmaha Asset Transfer Timeline

Date	From	To	Details
28/3/24	GL	MM	Official extension request to 12/04/24 (11th extension)
12/4/24			Deadline passed without any communication from SC
14/4/24	FT, Fiona Taylor COSS	MM	Update from COSS: SC trying to issue a decision today.